MANAGING INTER-ORGANIZATIONAL COLLABORATIONS

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

Series Editor: Michael Lounsbury

Recent Volumes:

Volume 38:	Configurational Theory and Methods in Organizational Research
Volume 39a:	Institutional Logics in Action, Part A
Volume 39b:	Institutional Logics in Action, Part B
Volume 40:	Contemporary Perspectives on Organizational Social Networks
Volume 41:	Religion and Organization Theory
Volume 42:	Organizational Transformation and Scientific Change: The Impact of Institutional Restructuring on Universities and Intellectual Innovation
Volume 43:	Elites on Trial
Volume 44:	Institutions and Ideals: Philip Selznick's Legacy for Organizational Studies
Volume 45:	Towards a Comparative Institutionalism: Forms, Dynamics and Logics Across the Organizational Fields of Health and Higher Education
Volume 46:	The University Under Pressure
Volume 47:	The Structuring of Work in Organizations
Volume 48A:	How Institutions Matter!
Volume 48B:	How Institutions Matter!
Volume 49:	Multinational Corporations and Organization Theory: Post Millennium Perspectives
Volume 50:	Emergence
Volume 51:	Categories, Categorization and Categorizing: Category Studies in Sociology, Organizations and Strategy at the Crossroads
Volume 52:	Justification, Evaluation and Critique in the Study of Organizations: Contributions from French Pragmatist Sociology
Volume 53:	structure, Content and Meaning of Organizational Networks: Extending Network Thinking
Volume 54A:	Multimodality, Meaning, and Institutions
Volume 54B:	Multimodality, Meaning, and Institutions
Volume 55:	Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
Volume 56:	Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
Volume 57:	Toward Permeable Boundaries of Organizations?
Volume 58:	Agents, Actors, Actorhood: Institutional Perspectives on the Nature
	of Agency, Action, and Authority
Volume 59:	The Production of Managerial Knowledge and Organizational Theory:
	New Approaches to Writing, Producing and Consuming Theory
Volume 60:	Race, Organizations, and the Organizing Process
Volume 61:	Routine Dynamics in Action
Volume 62:	Thinking Infrastructures
Volume 63:	The Contested Moralities of Markets

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS VOLUME 64

MANAGING INTER-ORGANIZATIONAL COLLABORATIONS: PROCESS VIEWS

EDITED BY

JÖRG SYDOW

Freie Universität Berlin, Germany

HANS BERENDS

Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, The Netherlands



United Kingdom – North America – Japan India – Malaysia – China Emerald Publishing Limited Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2019



Chapters 8 and 12 are Open Access with copyright assigned to the respective chapter authors.

All other chapters and editorial matter © Emerald Publishing Limited, 2019.

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-78756-592-0 (Print) ISBN: 978-1-78756-591-3 (Online) ISBN: 978-1-78756-593-7 (Epub)

ISSN: 0733-558X (Series)



ISOQAR certified Management System, awarded to Emerald for adherence to Environmental standard ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985 ISO 14001



CONTENTS

About the Contributors	
Introduction: Process Views on Inter-organizational Collaborations Hans Berends and Jörg Sydow	1
PART I RELATIONAL DYNAMICS IN INTER-ORGANIZATIONAL COLLABORATION	
Chapter 1 Relational Bonds Underlying Cooperative Inter-organizational Relations in Different Societal Contexts Peter Smith Ring and Andrew H. Van de Ven	13
Chapter 2 Building Adaptive Capacity in Project Network Organizations: Project Contexts, Network Ties, and Relational Practices Stephan Manning	39
Chapter 3 The Dynamics of Inter-organizational Relations in Contemporary Manufacturing: Nested Negotiations in Value Networks Harry Sminia, Anup Nair, Aylin Ates, Steve Paton and Marisa Smith	69
Chapter 4 Technological Embeddedness of Inter-organizational Collaboration Processes	09
Katharina Cepa and Henri Schildt	91
PART II ORGANIZATIONAL DYNAMICS FORMING AND DISSOLVING COLLABORATION	
Chapter 5 Insider Activists Pursuing an Agenda for Change: Selling the Need for Collaboration Kristina Lauche	19

vi CONTENTS

Chapter 6 Phased Acquisitions for Disruptive Innovation: Toward a Micro-level Governance Perspective Dries Faems and Anoop Madhok	139
Chapter 7 Entrepreneurs or Employees? The Emergence of "Disciplining Entrepreneurialism" in Subsidiary Organizations at CyberAgent	
Rick Delbridge, Takahiro Endo and Jonathan Morris	163
Chapter 8 Collaborative Uncoupling: How to Break Up and Stay Together	
Rene Wiedner and Shaz Ansari	185
PART III DYNAMIC COLLABORATION BEYOND ORGANIZATIONS	
Chapter 9 "Opening Innovation" Across Layers of Practices: Developing an Integrative View of the Emergence of Digital Health Karl-Emanuel Dionne and Paul Carlile	213
Chapter 10 How Organizations Manage Crowds: Define, Broadcast, Attract, and Select Linus Dahlander, Lars Bo Jeppesen and Henning Piezunka	239
Chapter 11 Crowd-open and Crowd-based Collaborations: Facilitating the Emergence of Organization Design	239
Luca Giustiniano, Terri L. Griffith and Ann Majchrzak Chapter 12 Collaborative Innovation Online: Entanglements	2/1
of the Making of Content, Skills, and Community on a	
Songwriting Platform Benjamin Schiemer, Elke Schüßler and Gernot Grabher	293
Index	317

LISTS OF FIGURES AND TABLES

FIGURES

-	Relational Bonds and Contexts in Which They May	
	Be Employed.	16
	Process Framework of the Development of	1.0
	Cooperative IORs.	18
•	Abstract Model of Project Network Organization	40
	Short: Project Network).	42
-	nter-context Connectivity and Adaptive Capacity of PNOs.	58
-	Relationship between Project Variety and Inter-context	60
	Connectivity.	60
	Three Paradoxes in Contemporary Manufacturing.	73
•	The Network of Gas Generators in Mass Spectrometers.	77
•	The GenMan–Alpha Relationship Network.	78
	The GenMan–Bravo Relationship Network.	78
U	Overview Data Structure.	144
	Case-specific Model of Phased Acquisition.	145
	Process Model of Governance Dynamics in Phased	
	Acquisitions.	155
-	ntegrating the Literatures for Opening Innovation.	218
•	Conceptualizing the Layers of Opening Innovation 1 Digital Health.	228
	Conceptualizing the <i>Layering</i> of Practices When Opening	
-	nnovation.	229
Fig. 10.1	llustrating the Stages and the Interdependencies.	241
•	Examples of Organizations Leveraging Crowds.	275
•	n Sync – Complementary Reinforcements among	
•	Processes at FAWM.	310
Fig. 12.2	Out of Sync – Interferences among Processes at FAWM.	311
	TABLES	
Table 1.1	Commitments Associated with Relational Bonds.	29
Table 5.1	Overview of Cases.	127
Table 5.2	Issue-selling Strategies Identified in Cases.	128
Table 7.1	Subsidiary Establishment and Closure since 2010.	172
Table 7.2		
	Comparison of Disciplining Entrepreneurialism	

Table 8.1	Comparing Organizational Restructuring Challenges.	189
Table 10.1	Applying the Framework for Making Decisions to	
	(Well-known) Cases of Crowdsourcing.	258
Table 10.A1	Overview of the Stages and Key Decisions.	266
Table 11.1	Organization Design Facilitators in Crowd-open and	
	Crowd-based Settings.	284
Table 12.1	Data Collection from February 2017 to February 2018.	301
Table 12.2	Development of Membership FAWM (2004–2018,	
	Userstatistics FAWM).	306
Table 12.3	FAWM Activities of the First Author in 2018.	307

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

Dr Shaz Ansari is a Professor of Strategy and Innovation at Judge Business School, University of Cambridge. He serves on Editorial Boards of *AMJ*, *AMR*, *Organization Science*, *JOM*, *JMS*, and *Organization Studies*. He has published in *AMJ*, *AMR*, *SMJ*, *Organization Science*, *JMS*, *Research Policy*, *ICC*, *JBE*, *Strategic Organization*, and *Organization Studies*.

Dr Aylin Ates is an Associate Professor in Strategy at the University of Strathclyde Business School, Glasgow, and the Programme Director of MSc Project Management and Innovation. She has published extensively in the area of strategic management in small and medium enterprises, among others in the *International Journal of Operations and Production Management, European Management Journal*, and *International Journal of Production Research*.

Dr Hans Berends is a Professor of Innovation and Organization at the School of Business and Economics, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam. His current research interests concern interorganizational collaboration and digital innovation, and he investigates these phenomena using a process research approach. He has published in leading journals including *Academy of Management Journal*, *Organization Science*, *Journal of Management Studies*, *Organization Studies*, and *Strategic Organization*.

Dr Paul Carlile is an Associate Professor of Management and Information Systems at Boston University's Questrom School of Business. He published widely on topics of innovation, managing knowledge across boundaries and digital disruption in journals, such as *Organization Science*, *Management Science*, and *Administrative Science Quarterly*.

Katharina Cepa is a Lecturer of Digital Strategy at Lancaster University Management School. Her research explores how the use of digital real-time data technologies in (inter-)organizational processes affects the management and strategy of organizations.

Dr Linus Dahlander is an Associate Professor and the Lufthansa Group Chair in Innovation at ESMT Berlin. He is interested in innovation, entrepreneurship, communities, and crowdsourcing.

Dr Rick Delbridge is a Professor of Organizational Analysis at Cardiff Business School. He is Co-editor of *JMSSays* and a former Associate Editor of *Academy of Management Review* and *Organization*. He is the Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences, British Academy of Management, and Learned Society of Wales.

Dr Karl-Emanuel Dionne is a Postdoctoral Researcher of Management at Boston University's Questrom School of Business and McGill University's Desautels Faculty of Management. His work focuses on topics of new forms of organizing for innovation, interdisciplinary innovation, open innovation events, and field emergence at the intersection of different sectors.

Dr Takahiro Endo is an Associate Professor of Organizational Analysis at Hitotsubashi University, Tokyo. His research interest lies in long-term change and continuity of management practice, such as "Japanese Management".

Dr Dries Faems holds the Chair of Entrepreneurship, Innovation and Technological Transformation at WHU – Otto Beisheim School of Management, Vallendar, Germany. He is also a Visiting Professor at the LUISS Business School in Rome. His current research focuses on collaboration for innovation and technological transformation.

Dr Luca Giustiniano is a Professor of Organization Studies at Department of Business and Management at LUISS University, where he is also the Director of the Centre for research in Leadership, Innovation and Organization. He is an editorial board member of *Journal of Management Studies* and *Review of Managerial Science*.

Dr Gernot Grabher is a Professor of Urban and Regional Economics at HafenCity University Hamburg. He was an Editor of Economic Geography, an Editor of the RSA Regions and Cities book series, and also a Member of the editorial boards of the *Cambridge Journal of Regions, Economy and Society, European Urban* and *Regional Studies, Industry and Innovation,* and *Social Sciences*.

Dr Terri L. Griffith is a Professor of Management and Entrepreneurship at Santa Clara University. She studies how technologies, practices, and human capabilities can be woven together to achieve performance. Her most recent research considers the bottom-up integration of artificial intelligence into work.

Dr Lars Bo Jeppesen is a Professor of Innovation Management at Copenhagen Business School. His research focuses on innovation in the digital economy. His work has been published in a variety of management journals such as *Organization Science, Strategic Management Journal*, and *Research Policy*.

Dr Kristina Lauche is the Chair of Organizational Development and Design at Nijmegen School of Management, Radboud University, The Netherlands. Her research draws on practice approaches to understand how people address complex problems that require interorganizational collaboration and pursue organizational or field-level change. She has investigated such processes in the context of new product development, sustainability, healthcare, and creative industries. Her work has been published in journals such as *Academy of Management Journal*, *Organization Science*, and *MIS Quarterly*.

Dr Anoop Madhok is a Professor of Strategy and the Distinguished Scotiabank Professor in International Business and Entrepreneurship at the Schulich School of Business, York University, Toronto. His more recent research focused on the various aspects of collaboration, and his current research focuses on the organization and governance of platform-based businesses.

Dr Ann Majchrzak is an Associate of USC Chaired Professor of Business Administration at the Marshall School of Business. She does research on any interesting intersection of digital innovation and organizational systems. She is publishing a new book: *How Open Crowds Can Collaboratively Solve Big Societal and Business Problems*.

Dr Stephan Manning is a Professor of Strategy and Innovation at University of Sussex, UK. His research covers topics such as sustainability standards, social entrepreneurship, project-based organizing, and global services sourcing. He has published in journals such as *SMJ*, *JMS*, *JIBS*, *Research Policy*, *Organization Studies*, and *Human Relations*. He is Senior Editor of *Management and Organization Review*.

Dr Jonathan Morris is a Professor of Organizational Analysis and an Associate Dean for Research at Cardiff University's Business School.

Dr Anup Karath Nair is a Lecturer in Engineering Management at the University of Strathclyde, Glasgow. He holds a PhD in Strategy and Organization from the Strathclyde Business School. His research investigates the challenges associated with realizing strategy and innovation within engineering and technology-driven businesses.

Dr Steve Paton is a Senior Lecturer in the Department of Management Science at the University of Strathclyde, Glasgow. Following a 20-year career in the aerospace industry, he transferred to academia. He currently researches in operations and project management, and is particularly interested in the management of work within project-based networked environments.

Dr Henning Piezunka is an Assistant Professor at INSEAD, Fontainebleau. He does research on crowdsourcing, collaboration, and competition. He is an Editorial Board Member at the *Academy of Management Review*. He has a PhD from the Stanford University.

Dr Peter Smith Ring is a Professor Emeritus of Strategic Management with the College of Business Administration at Loyola Marymount University in Los Angeles. He is or was an Editorial Board Member of *Strategic Management Journal*, *Academy of Management Review, California Management Review, International Journal of Business Strategic Alliances, Nonprofit Management Review Journal*, and *Journal of Management Studies*.

Benjamin Schiemer, **MSc**, is a Doctoral Researcher at the Institute of Organization Science at Johannes Kepler University Linz. His research interests cover organizational anthropology, ethnography, science and technology studies, and processual studies of collaborative creativity in music.

Dr Henri Schildt is a Professor of Strategy at Aalto University School of Business, Helsinki, where he heads the Department of Management Studies. His research spans strategy, organization theory, and entrepreneurship. His current research projects examine the organizational creation of social value and how digital data influences organizing.

Dr Elke Schüßler is a Professor of Business Administration and Head of the Institute of Organization Science at Johannes Kepler University Linz. Her research interests revolve around organization and management theories, work and employment relations, and creativity and innovation. She currently examines labor standards in global supply chains and new forms of digital organizing.

Dr Harry Sminia is a Professor in Strategic Management at Strathclyde Business School in Glasgow. His research interests are in the area of processes of strategy formation, strategic change, and competitive positioning. He is also interested in process research methods and methodology.

Dr Marisa Smith is a Lecturer in Strategy and Innovation at Strathclyde Business School at the University of Strathclyde, Glasgow. She is published in a range of journals on topics related to innovation and operations management. She employs an engaged scholarship approach to her research.

Dr Jörg Sydow is a Professor of Management at the School of Business & Economics at Freie Universität Berlin. He was a Fellow of the Advanced Institute of Management Research and an Editorial Board Member of *Organization Science*, *Organization Studies*, *Academy of Management Journal*, *Academy of Management Review*, and *Journal of Management Studies*. Currently, he is a Senior Editor of *Organization Studies*.

Dr Andrew H. Van de Ven is a Professor Emeritus in the Carlson School of the University of Minnesota. He received his PhD from the University of Wisconsin at Madison in 1972. He conducts research and writes on managing organizational innovation, change, design and behavior, and engaged scholarship research methods. He was President of the Academy of Management (2000–2001), and was Founding Editor of *Academy of Management Discoveries* (2013–1017).

Dr Rene Wiedner is an Associate Professor and a member of the Process, Practice and Institutions (PPI) Research Programme at Warwick Business School, University of Warwick. His research focuses on change, collaboration, and innovation in healthcare and the creative industries. He received his PhD from the University of Cambridge.

INTRODUCTION: PROCESS VIEWS ON INTER-ORGANIZATIONAL COLLABORATIONS

Hans Berends and Jörg Sydow

Inter-organizational collaboration has become indispensable for many organizations. Organizations may collaborate, for instance, to develop innovations (e.g., Powell, Koput, & Smith-Doerr, 1996), address grand challenges (Seidl & Werle, 2018), streamline supply chains (e.g., Dyer & Nobeoka, 2000), set standards (Leiponen, 2008), realize creative projects (Windeler & Sydow, 2001), or respond to emergencies (e.g., Beck & Plowman, 2014). Inter-organizational collaboration enables organizations to pool resources and accomplish objectives that they cannot realize on their own (Gray, 1985).

As a consequence, inter-organizational collaboration has emerged as a key topic in management and organization research since the 1980s. It has been studied from many perspectives including resource dependence and resource-based views, transaction cost economics, social networks, institutional theory, organizational learning, and many others (see, e.g., Barringer & Harrison, 2000). Specialized literature has emerged on specific forms of collaboration such as alliances, consortia, industry–university collaboration, project networks, global production networks, cross-sectional partnerships, regional clusters, and meta-organizations. Much of this literature has taken a variance research approach (Langley, 1999; Mohr, 1982) as it has been concerned with the conditions for effective collaboration, the properties of collaborative relationships, and the outcomes of collaboration (see, e.g., Gulati, Wohlgezogen, & Zhelyazkov, 2012; Salvato, Reuer, & Battigalli, 2017, for reviews).

Another approach which is central to this volume, however, has been to focus on processes of inter-organizational collaboration. A process approach views "phenomena dynamically – in terms of movement, activity, events, change and temporal evolution" (Langley, 2007). Process research seeks to explain how phenomena emerge, develop, grow, or terminate over time (Langley, 1999). Process is a distinct way of theorizing as well as a way of conducting research (e.g., Langley & Tsoukas, 2017;

Managing Inter-organizational Collaborations: Process Views Research in the Sociology of Organizations, Volume 64, 1–10 Copyright © 2019 by Emerald Publishing Limited All rights of reproduction in any form reserved Van de Ven & Poole, 1995). Process research on inter-organizational collaboration seeks to explain how it emerges, develops, changes, and ends, usually by taking a longitudinal approach in order to trace events over time. Early research on inter-organizational collaboration has already acknowledged its processual aspects (e.g., Gray, 1985). Process research on inter-organizational collaboration received a boost in the 1990s from early papers by Ring and Van de Ven (1992, 1994) and a special issue in *Organization Science* (1998), and has received more attention ever since (cf. Majchrzak, Jarvenpaa, & Bagherzadeh, 2015).

Over time, research on inter-organizational collaboration processes has become more attentive to the complexities involved. Early process models often represented the process of collaboration as a life cycle (e.g., D'Aunno & Zuckerman, 1987), a linear sequence of stages through which partners could move in the development of their collaboration, including, for example, its initiation, negotiation, formation, and operation (Schilke & Cook, 2013). In-depth empirical studies have, however, pointed out that real-life cases usually do not follow such an orderly sequence (e.g., Deken, Berends, Gemser, & Lauche, 2018; De Rond & Bouchikhi, 2004). The development of collaboration is also driven by the agency of managers who respond to intermediate outcomes and shifting conditions (e.g., Ariño & De la Torre, 1998; Das & Teng, 2002; Doz, 1996). Thus, the development of inter-organizational relationships typically comprises iterations of initiation, action, evaluation, and readjustment, to recalibrate the initial terms and conditions for the partnership, incorporate learnings, and adapt to changing conditions. Other studies emphasize the impact of existing relations on new partnerships (e.g., Gulati, 1995; Li & Rowley, 2002), demonstrating that managerial agency is enabled and constrained by the web of relations spun through prior interactions. In addition to past experiences, future expectations also matter in processes of relationship building, maintenance, and ending (e.g., Ligthart, Oerlemans, & Noorderhaven, 2016).

The interplay of structural dimensions and managerial agency in such processes has been captured in structuration theoretical accounts of inter-organizational collaboration (e.g., Berends, van Burg, & van Raaij, 2011; Manning, 2010; Sydow & Windeler, 1998). Structuration theory explains how social reality is continuously in the making through the interaction of structure and agency: knowledgeable actors draw upon structural dimensions that enable as well as constrain actions and thereby either reproduce or transform these structures with the help of practices. Collaboration is not determined by preexisting conditions, but not free to be formed by rational managers, either. Inter-organizational collaboration is continuously in motion and inherent tensions are never fully resolved (De Rond & Bouchikhi, 2004; Putnam, Fairhurst, & Banghart, 2017).

This ever-evolving nature of inter-organizational collaboration emerged as a consistent finding in Majchrzak et al.'s (2015) review of in-depth process studies, irrespective of whether they adopt a weak or strong process view (Langley et al., 2013). Collaboration evolves due to organizational agency, inherent tensions, external events, and the achievement of outcomes. Majchzrak et al. conclude from their review that stability is not per se preferred: dynamics in goals, interactions, and governance actually indicates a healthy collaboration process.

In order to give just one example: more often than not, goals are not clear at the outset of a collaborative endeavor, but can only be defined in this very process of collaborating (Huxham & Vangen, 2005). That is not to say that anything goes. Process research has uncovered nuanced insights into the dynamics which help to move forward with the initiation, development, or maintenance of inter-organizational collaborations, and into which dynamics are detrimental.

This volume seeks to advance research on processes of inter-organizational collaboration. The contributing chapters are organized in three parts. The first part focuses on the theme that has received most attention in process research on collaboration: relational dynamics between partnering organizations. The second part advances beyond current approaches by shifting attention to changes in the organizations involved in collaboration and the transformation of intraorganizational collaboration into inter-organizational collaboration, and vice versa. Finally, the third part broadens the perspective by considering emerging forms of more distributed collaboration with crowds and other groups of heterogeneous actors.

RELATIONAL DYNAMICS IN INTER-ORGANIZATIONAL COLLABORATION (PART I)

A significant share of research into inter-organizational collaboration has focused on the relations between collaborating partners. Relations can be studied as entities with properties, which can be characterized in terms, for instance, of commitment, trust, mutual understanding, governance modes, or contractual obligations. Process views of inter-organizational collaboration move beyond the description of properties and make two related moves. First, process researchers investigate organizational processes within such relations; in other words, they analyze the relational embeddedness of interactions. Second, a processual view takes these relational features not as being stable or given, but as being in motion. From the early studies of Ring and Van de Ven (1992, 1994), the development and change of relations has been the focus of research. Today, inspired by structuration theory and other theories of practice, research has examined relations themselves as a processual phenomenon. More often than not aligned with a process philosophy of becoming (e.g., Helin, Hernes, Hjorth, & Holt, 2014; Tsoukas & Chia, 2002), researchers argue that inter-organizational relations exist only in so far as they are enacted. These moves surface in different ways in the four chapters of Part I.

In Chapter 1, Peter Smith Ring and Andrew H. Van de Ven extend their classic work on the development of inter-organizational relationships (Ring & Van de Ven, 1992, 1994). Starting from the observation that the trust assumed in the development of an inter-organizational relationship is not always present in a particular society, they theorize three types of relational bonds. In addition to trust-based commitments, they discern forbearance-based and apprehension-based commitments. Whereas trust-based commitment fits societies with strong exogenous institutional protection, forbearance-based commitment fits societies with moderate levels, and apprehension-based commitments with low levels of exogenous institutional protection. They explain how collaboration processes in these

different types of relational bonds play out over time: during negotiations, after contracts have been entered into, and when repairing breaches in relational bonds.

Subsequently, in Chapter 2, Stephan Manning explores the processual characteristics of organizing in project networks. In the context of TV movie production, he examines how project network organizations create new collaborations for each production by effectively drawing upon a network of previous collaborative relations. He finds that the adaptive capacity of these organizations depends not only on structural network properties and strategic agency, but also on the contextual embedding and disembedding of network ties and relational practices. This requires seeing how previous collaborations and practices might connect with a new project, drawing both on a specific joint history as well as the broader potential of past partners and practices. Along the way, these findings also offer an excellent illustration of the structurational insight that the existence and value of relations depends upon recurrent collective efforts to enact those relations in practice.

In Chapter 3, Harry Sminia, Anup Nair, Aylin Ates, Steve Paton, and Marisa Smith analyze how actual interactions between organization members define an inter-organizational relationship. In a study of contemporary manufacturing and the supply networks involved, they focus on the people maintaining, changing, and developing relationships between organizations. They unpack how actors deal with three paradoxes: the capability paradox, the appropriation paradox, and the governance paradox. A key feature of their insights is that these paradoxes are addressed in nested relationships. Zooming in on an inter-organizational relationship between partner organizations reveals a nested network of interpersonal relations in which the challenges of organizing are addressed.

Finally, Chapter 4 by Katharina Cepa and Henri Schildt directs attention to the technological dimension of inter-organizational relations, which has hitherto been underemphasized. Focusing in particular on big data technologies, they propose the concept of "technological embeddedness" to capture how technology is used to shape activities at inter-organizational interfaces. They develop propositions on how technological embeddedness facilitates inter-organizational collaboration processes, such as the development of trust, mutual adaptation, and the temporal structuring of inter-organizational interactions.

ORGANIZATIONAL DYNAMICS FORMING AND DISSOLVING COLLABORATION (PART II)

Part II of this volume addresses organizational dynamics in collaboration processes. Much previous research on inter-organizational collaboration has taken those organizations involved in collaboration for granted, by black-boxing them or treating them as monolithic wholes. Typically, scholars have investigated how the collaborations emerge, develop, and change over time. Much less attention has been paid to what happens in, or with, the partnering organizations themselves. As an initial step into this direction, some earlier studies unpacked how people and groups within organizations drive the formation and dissolution of inter-organizational collaboration (e.g., Berends et al., 2011; Marchington & Vincent, 2004). The chapters

in the second part further advance insight into organizational dynamics in the development of inter-organizational collaboration.

Across the chapters, related insights can be discerned. First, organizations themselves are not stable in any collaboration: just as collaboration is fluid, organizations, too, are more or less continuously changing and intraorganizational dynamics are the key to understanding the dynamics of external collaboration, and vice versa. Moreover, these chapters point at the continuity between intraorganizational collaboration and inter-organizational collaboration. Inter-organizational collaboration can transform into intraorganizational collaboration (Faems & Madhok, Chapter 6), and intraorganizational collaboration can transform into inter-organizational collaboration (Delbridge, Endo & Morris, Chapter 7; Wiedner & Ansari, Chapter 8). The chapters also underscore the value of a process approach, as they show in various ways how, at one point in time, collaborative processes are of consequence for transformed processes at a later stage.

The opening chapter in this second part, Chapter 5, is by Kristina Lauche. She focuses attention on the individuals within an organization, who advocate collaboration as a means to realize change. Extending previous work on the role of individuals in the context of inter-organizational relations, she investigates the intraorganizational dynamics before organizations enter into relations. In particular, Lauche zooms in on the "issue selling" efforts of organization members. She shows how interaction with external actors helps organization members to understand complex problems (see also Seidl & Werle, 2018), and how those organization members draw upon their external network to promote change and make the case for collaboration internal. Six different cases illustrate different issue-selling strategies to mobilize various recipients. These deliberate efforts at the intraorganizational level contribute to an emergent trajectory at the level of inter-organizational collaboration.

In Chapter 6, Dries Faems and Anoop Madhok present and theorize an indepth case study of collaborating partners that gradually merge into one organization. A multi-national company called GCOMP first took an equity stake in a technology-based start-up labeled OPTICS, then later actually acquired OPTICS. Whereas much of the alliance literature has investigated the consequences of macro-level governance modes such as equity alliances (e.g., Oxley & Sampson, 2004; Salvato et al., 2017), the chapter by Faems and Madhok dives into microlevel forms of governance. The micro-level forms of governance shift from armslength governance to embedded governance in the equity alliance, and then to preserving and later absorbing the acquired start-up. Moreover, the authors show how micro-level processes, such as trust building and knowledge transfer, subsequently influence the conditions and trigger choices at the macro-level. In this way, the chapter also illustrates how inter-organizational collaboration can morph via multiple micro- and macro-level shifts into intraorganizational collaboration. Thus, changes in the form of collaboration are also associated with changes in the internal organizing of both partners.

The last two chapters in this part describe a related phenomenon with dynamics moving in the opposite direction: constituents of a single organization which separate and form autonomous organizations, thereby transforming intraorganizational collaboration into inter-organizational collaboration. Chapter 7 by Rick Delbridge, Takahiro Endo, and Jonathan Morris uncovers the phenomenon of "disciplining entrepreneurialism". This particular approach combines elements of hierarchy, markets, and networks, yet is distinct from all of them. Based on an in-depth study of a media, gaming, and advertising business called CyberAgent, they show how entrepreneurial individuals were encouraged to seek and grasp opportunities for new business projects, which they could pursue as subsidiary firms. Despite the formal hierarchical relationship with headquarters, such subsidiaries had a strong sense of autonomy. Initial socialization with the values of the parent organization, however, also meant that individuals who autonomously pursued opportunities as a subsidiary did so with a sense of loyalty to the parent organization and disciplined by a shared sense of corporate identity.

Finally, in Chapter 8, Rene Wiedner and Shaz Ansari further theorize processes of separation leading to inter-organizational collaboration. The rich literature on the formation of inter-organizational collaboration (e.g., Deken et al., 2018) typically assumes that collaboration is initiated by two distinct organizations. Wiedner and Ansari, instead, examine how collaboration can emerge as constituent parts of a single organization become separate. Drawing upon the subtle but important distinction between autonomy and independence, they develop a process perspective on "collaborative separation", which does not lead to independent entities, but establishes autonomy while harnessing remaining interdependencies. Collaborative separation may help to increase performance and sustain access to resources, but several factors, ranging from regulations to feelings of betrayal and shame, may prove to be a barrier. They, therefore, identify five steps that can aid separating organizations to develop effective collaboration.

DYNAMIC COLLABORATION BEYOND ORGANIZATIONS (PART III)

Over the past two decades, new forms of collaboration have become more prevalent. Much of the empirical literature has focused on relatively stable forms of collaboration, involving established organizations in strategic alliances, joint ventures and R&D consortia. While these "traditional" forms of inter-organizational collaboration still exist, they are frequently complemented with more fluid forms of collaboration involving a larger variety of partners. These include, for instance, ecosystems around open source software and digital platforms that allow organizations to collaborate at arm's length with organizations and individuals developing complementary products and services. Many of these new forms of collaboration are enabled by digital technologies, and they typically involve a heterogeneous and distributed set of partners, potentially including organizations as well as loose collections of individuals. As a consequence, collaboration dynamics tend even to be emergent and fluid.

In this volume, we have four chapters exploring such dynamics of collaboration that extend beyond organizations. In Chapter 9, Karl-Emanuel Dionne and Paul Carlile report about the opening up for innovation to access and develop

a greater amount and variety of knowledge and resources. The authors' critical literature review, paired with an analysis of different empirical cases from a nonprofit organization helping to drive digital health innovation, reveals usercentric, firm-centric, and field-centric approaches to opening innovation that progressively connects a greater variety of actors and resources. The authors show how specific new relational practices address the new relational dynamics which these connections bring in order to accumulate more resources for innovation and sustain progress.

Chapter 10, written by Linus Dahlander, Lars Bo Jeppesen, and Henning Piezunka, integrates research on organization theory and innovation and develops a framework that characterizes crowdsourcing as a sequential process through which organizations (1) define the task they wish to have completed; (2) broadcast to a pool of potential contributors; (3) attract a crowd of contributors; and (4) select among the inputs they receive. For each of these phases, the authors identify the key decisions organizations make, provide a basic explanation for each decision, discuss what the trade-off organizations face when choosing among decision alternatives, and explore how organizations may resolve these trade-offs. This decision-centric approach shows that there are fundamental interdependencies in the process, which makes the coordination of crowdsourcing challenging.

In Chapter 11, Luca Giustiniano, Terri L. Griffith, and Ann Majchrzak focus on the forms of collaboration that blur the lines between organizations, calling into question the fundamental label of crowd-focused inter-organizational collaboration. The authors employ the concept of liminality and consider two forms: crowd-open and crowd-based organizations. They show the organizational design impact of openness that spans from the mere scalability associated with organizational growth to the phenomena of reshaping formalization and the standardization of roles and processes, and self-organizing over time.

The final chapter of this volume, Chapter 12, also advances our understanding of collaborative innovation processes that span across organizational boundaries. In this case, Benjamin Schiemer, Elke Schüßler, and Gernot Grabher report ethnographic research about an online platform that supports distributed songwriting. They discovered three parallel processes that were triggered and maintained over time by the temporary stabilization of provisional, interim outcomes: content-in-the-making, skill-in-the-making, and community-in-the-making. Quite in line with a practice-based view, the authors elucidate interferences between these three processes and highlight the constructive role of incompleteness (Garud, Jain, & Tuertscher, 2008).

CONCLUSION

This volume presents an up-to-date window into process research on interorganizational collaboration. In this introduction, we have identified several process themes that cut across these chapters, the comparison of which reveals a large variety of theoretical perspectives. Process research often develops in dialogue with core theories on collaboration and organizing (e.g., on governance, networks, and resources), which are not per se processual in nature. Process research contributes to making such perspectives more dynamic, for instance, by examining core assumptions, uncovering how causal mechanisms play out over time, or showing how fundamental processes unfold in the context of collaboration. Engaging with broader theoretical perspectives, however important, may have the unintended consequence of limiting the accumulation of findings into a distinct body of process insights. That is a clear challenge for future process research on inter-organizational collaboration.

The chapters in this volume have pointed at several areas requiring further research from a process perspective, and could therefore become themes for the further accumulation of process insights. First, more research is needed on the tensions and contradictions involved in collaboration. Tensions and contradictions point to the limits and potential dark sides of collaboration, but are also the engine of progress and change in collaboration. Second, the relation between intraorganizational and inter-organizational processes is a new area that calls for further research. Some of the chapters observed interactions between interorganizational and intraorganizational processes and theorized how they may transform into each other. The increasing permeability of boundaries and fluidity of collaboration calls for a deepening of this line of research. Finally, more research is needed on new forms of collaboration. As technological development progresses, distributed forms of collaboration are likely to increase over the coming years. This will invite further exploration of these phenomena and call for the examination of differences between the types of collaborative processes.

Future process research faces some methodological challenges. Attention to how people deal with tensions in day-to-day organizing calls for ethnographic research approaches. However, the more collaboration becomes distributed and emergent, the more difficult it becomes to trace, requiring smart choices in how to do ethnographic research in such settings (Berthod, Grothe-Hammer, & Sydow, 2017). Ethnographic and other qualitative approaches can be complemented by the study of digital traces which are becoming more and more abundant, ranging from e-mail and enterprise social media to workflow systems and algorithmic data decision making. The quantitative analysis of digital traces may document patterns that qualitative sources may help to further explain. Such multi-method studies may help to overcome the limitations of any specific method and contribute to the further advancement of process research on inter-organizational collaboration.

REFERENCES

- Ariño, A., & De La Torre, J. (1998). Learning from failure: Towards an evolutionary model of collaborative ventures. *Organization Science*, 9(3), 306–325.
- Barringer, B. R., & Harrison, J. S. (2000). Walking a tightrope: Creating value through interorganizational relationships. *Journal of Management*, 26(3), 367–403.
- Beck, T. E., & Plowman, D. A. (2014). Temporary, emergent interorganizational collaboration in unexpected circumstances: A study of the Columbia space shuttle response effort. *Organization Science*, 25(4), 1234–1252.
- Berends, H., van Burg, E., & van Raaij, E. M. (2011). Contacts and contracts: Cross-level network dynamics in the development of an aircraft material. *Organization Science*, 22(4), 940–960.

Berthod, O., Grothe-Hammer, M., & Sydow, J. (2017). Network ethnography: A mixed-method approach for the study of practices in interorganizational settings. *Organizational Research Methods*, 20(2), 299–323.

- D'Aunno, T. A., & Zuckerman, H. S. (1987). A life-cycle model of organizational federations: The case of hospitals. *Academy of Management Review*, 12(3), 534–545.
- Das, T. K., & Teng, B.-S. (2002). The dynamics of alliance conditions in the alliance development process. *Journal of Management Studies*, 39(5), 725–746.
- De Rond, M., & Bouchikhi, H. (2004). On the dialectics of strategic alliances. *Organization Science*, 15(1), 56–69.
- Deken, F., Berends, H., Gemser, G., & Lauche, K. (2018). Strategizing and the initiation of interorganizational collaboration through prospective resourcing. Academy of Management Journal, 61(5), 1920–1950.
- Doz, Y. L. (1996). The evolution of cooperation in strategic alliances: Initial conditions or learning processes? *Strategic Management Journal*, 17(S1), 55–83.
- Dyer, J. H., & Nobeoka, K. (2000). Creating and managing a high-performance knowledge-sharing network: The Toyota case. *Strategic Management Journal*, 21(3), 345–367.
- Garud, R., Jain, S., & Tuertscher, P. (2008). Incomplete by design and designing for incompleteness. *Organization Studies*, 29(3), 351–371.
- Gray, B. (1985). Conditions facilitating interorganizational collaboration. Human Relations, 38(10), 911–936.
- Gulati, R. (1995). Social structure and alliance formation patterns: A longitudinal analysis. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 40(4), 619–652.
- Gulati, R., Wohlgezogen, F., & Zhelyazkov, P. (2012). The two facets of collaboration: Cooperation and coordination in strategic alliances. *Academy of Management Annals*, 6(1), 531–583.
- Helin, J., Hernes, T., Hjorth, D., & Holt, R. (Eds.). (2014). *The Oxford handbook of process philosophy and organization studies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Huxham, C., & Vangen, S. (2013). Managing to collaborate: The theory and practice of collaborative advantage. London: Routledge.
- Langley, A. (1999). Strategies for theorizing from process data. *Academy of Management Review*, 24(4), 691–710.
- Langley, A. (2007). Process thinking in strategic organization. Strategic Organization, 5(3), 271–282.
- Langley, A., & Tsoukas, H. (Eds.). (2017). *The SAGE handbook of process organization studies*. London: Sage.
- Langley, A., Smallman, C., Tsoukas, H., & Van de Ven, A. H. (2013). Process studies of change in organization and management: Unveiling temporality, activity, and flow. *Academy of Management Journal*, 56(1), 1–13.
- Leiponen, A. E. (2008). Competing through cooperation: The organization of standard setting in wireless telecommunications. *Management Science*, *54*(11), 1904–1919.
- Li, S. X., & Rowley, T. J. (2002). Inertia and evaluation mechanisms in interorganizational partner selection: Syndicate formation among U.S. investment banks. *Academy of Management Journal*, 45(6), 1104–1119.
- Ligthart, R., Oerlemans, L., & Noorderhaven, N. (2016). In the shadows of time: A case study of flexibility behaviors in an interorganizational project. *Organization Studies*, 37(12), 1721–1743.
- Majchrzak, A., Jarvenpaa, S. L., & Bagherzadeh, M. (2015). A review of interorganizational collaboration dynamics. *Journal of Management*, 41(5), 1338–1360.
- Manning, S. (2010). The strategic formation of project networks: A relational practice perspective. *Human Relations*, 63(4), 551–573.
- Marchington, M., & Vincent, S. (2004). Analysing the influence of institutional, organizational and interpersonal forces in shaping inter-organizational relations. *Journal of Management Studies*, 41(6), 1029–1056.
- Mohr, L. B. (1982). Explaining organizational behavior. San-Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Oxley, J. E., & Sampson, R. C. (2004). The scope and governance of international R&D alliances. Strategic Management Journal, 25(8–9), 723–749.
- Powell, W. W., Koput, K. W., & Smith-Doerr, L. (1996). Inter-organizational collaboration and the locus of innovation: Networks of learning in biotechnology. Administrative Science Quarterly, 116–145.

- Putnam, L. L., Fairhurst, G. T., & Banghart, S. (2017). Contradictions, dialectics, and paradoxes in organizations: A constitutive approach. *Academy of Management Annals*, 10(1), 65–171.
- Ring, P. S., & Van de Ven, A. H. (1992). Structuring cooperative relationships between organizations. Strategic Management Journal, 13(7), 483–498.
- Ring, P. S., & Van de Ven, A. H. (1994). Developmental processes of cooperative interorganizational relationships. *Academy of Management Review*, 19(1), 90–118.
- Salvato, C., Reuer, J. J., & Battigalli, P. (2017). Cooperation across disciplines: A multilevel perspective on cooperative behavior in governing interfirm relations. *Academy of Management Annals*, 11(2), 960–1004.
- Schilke, O., & Cook, K. S. (2013). A cross-level process theory of trust development in interorganizational relationships. *Strategic Organization*, 11(3), 281–303.
- Seidl, D., & Werle, F. (2018). Inter-organizational sensemaking in the face of strategic meta-problems: Requisite variety and dynamics of participation. Strategic Management Journal, 39(3), 830–858.
- Sydow, J., & Windeler, A. (1998). Organizing and evaluating interfirm networks: A structurationist perspective on network processes and effectiveness. *Organization Science*, 9(3), 265–284.
- Tsoukas, H., & Chia, R. (2002). On organizational becoming: Rethinking organizational change. *Organization Science*, 13(5), 567–582.
- Van de Ven, A. H., & Poole, M. S. (1995). Explaining development and change in organizations. *Academy of Management Review*, 20(3), 510–540.
- Windeler, A., & Sydow, J. (2001). Project networks and changing industry practices collaborative content production in the German television industry. *Organization Studies*, 22(6), 1035–1060.