

# GRACE ANN ROSILE

# TRIBAL WISDOM FOR BUSINESS ETHICS



# TRIBAL WISDOM FOR BUSINESS ETHICS

# TRIBAL WISDOM FOR BUSINESS ETHICS

### BY

### **GRACE ANN ROSILE**

New Mexico State University, Las Cruces, New Mexico, USA



United Kingdom – North America – Japan India – Malaysia – China Emerald Group Publishing Limited Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2016

Copyright © 2016 Emerald Group Publishing Limited

### Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

### **British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-78635-288-0 (Print) ISBN: 978-1-78635-287-3 (Online)



ISOQAR certified Management System, awarded to Emerald for adherence to Environmental standard ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985 ISO 14001



### **Contents**

Lis	t of Figures	ix
List of Cases		X
Lis	List of Contributors	
De	dication	хī
Pr€	eface and Map to the Territory	xvi
	PART I WISDOM OF THE ELDERS	
1.	Eight Aspects of Tribal Wisdom for Business Ethics, and Why They Matter  Grace Ann Rosile with cases by Carma M. Claw	ŝ
2.	Indigenous Ways of Knowing and Quantum Science for Business Ethics  Donald D. Pepion	17
3.	Indigenous Ways of Knowing and Business Sustainability  Lisa Grayshield	23
4.	Indigenous Science for Business Ethics and the Environment Gregory Cajete with cases by Grace Ann Rosile	31

5.	Business Ethics Overview and Current Trends	
	Grace Ann Rosile with cases by Mabel Sanchez	39
	PART II STORYTELLING AND INDIGENOUS PEDAGOGIES FOR BUSINESS ETHICS	
6.	A Coyote Story for Business Ethics Pedagogy Gregory Cajete	69
7.	But that's Not a Story! Antenarrative Dialectics Between and Beneath Indigenous Living Story and Western Narratives David M. Boje	73
8.	So, What Does it Mean? Mysterious Practices of Indigenous Storytellers <i>Grace Ann Rosile</i>	87
-	PART III FRADE, BARTER, AND ETHICAL BUSINESS RELATIONSHI	PS.
9.	Ethical Business Practices in Dardan Enterprises  Daniel Stewart	103
10.	Native American Values Applied to Leadership and Business Ethics Education Amy Klemm Verbos, Deanna M. Kennedy and Carma M. Claw	111
11.	Early North American Trading Practice and Philosophy Calvin M. Boardman	125
12.	Power Stories and Mutually Beneficial Negotiations: Fostering Ensemble Leadership Grace Ann Rosile	147

13.	Native American Entrepreneurship: Locating Your Busines  Daniel Stewart and Vincent J. Pascal	s 165	
PART IV BUSINESS ETHICS EDUCATION IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE NATURAL ENVIRONMENT			
14.	Remember to Remember: The Alameda Transit Station Grace Ann Rosile	177	
15.	Critique of the Triple Bottom Line  David M. Boje	181	
16.	Songs of the Pika and Others at the Bighorn Medicine Whe Gerri Elise McCulloh	el 199	
17.	The Trees are Breathing Us: An Indigenous View of Relationship in Nature and Business Kaylynn Sullivan TwoTrees and Matthew Kolan	211	
CONCLUSION: RESPONSES OF THE NON-INDIGENOUS BUSINESS WORLD TO INDIGENOUS INITIATIVES			
18.	Weaving IWOK into the Storying of Business, Ethics, and the Busy-Ness of Being Human <i>Maria Humphries</i>	225	
19.	Tribal Wisdom in Today's Business Environment Grace Ann Rosile	235	
Epil	Epilogue: What Does It Mean?		
Abo	About the Authors		
Index		251	
	Contents	vii	

# **List of Figures**

Chapter 14				
Figure 14.1	Ginny's Submission to City of El Paso Museums and Cultural Affairs Department El Paso Public Art Program	178		
Chapter 15				
Figure 15.1	Spiral of Development of SOS, from the January 13, 2014 Agreement on President's Excellence Fund, Academic Associate Deans Council (ADAC), and Office of Institutional Analysis (OIA)	191		
Figure 15.2	"Heart-of-Care" and Various Shades of Green Sustainability "School Spirit" in the Operations, Research, Education, and			
	Community of NMSU	192		

### **List of Cases**

Chapter 1	
"The Role of Language"	12
"Basketball Playoffs"	14
Chapter 4	
"The Business of Culture at Acoma"	35
Chapter 5	
"NOVA Corp."	54
"Laguna Development Corp"	62
Chapter 10	
"Sacred Wind Communications"	118

### **List of Contributors**

Calvin M. Boardman University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT,

USA

David M. Boje New Mexico State University, Las Cruces,

NM, USA

Gregory Cajete University of New Mexico, Albuquerque,

NM, USA

Carma M. Claw New Mexico State University, Las Cruces,

NM, USA

Lisa Grayshield New Mexico State University, Las Cruces,

NM, USA

Maria Humphries University of Waikato, Hamilton,

New Zealand

Deanna M. Kennedy University of Washington Bothell, Bothell,

WA, USA

Matthew Kolan University of Vermont, Burlington, VT,

USA

Gerri Elise McCulloh New Mexico State University, Las Cruces,

NM, USA

Vincent J. Pascal Eastern Washington University, Spokane,

WA, USA

Donald D. Pepion New Mexico State University, Las Cruces,

NM, USA

Grace Ann Rosile New Mexico State University, Las Cruces,

NM, USA

Mabel Sanchez New Mexico State University, Las Cruces,

NM, USA

Daniel Stewart Gonzaga University, Spokane, WA, USA

Kaylynn Sullivan University of Vermont, Burlington, VT,

TwoTrees USA

Amy Klemm Verbos University of Wisconsin-Whitewater,

Whitewater, WI, USA

I dedicate this book to my husband David M. Boje, who brought love and adventure to my life, and helped me find my voice as a writer.

# Preface and Map to the Territory

I am Grace Ann Rosile, Ph.D., Professor of Management at New Mexico State University. My family is from the Western Pennsylvania area around Pittsburgh. I am of Italian-American heritage, or, as I sometime say, half Italian and half Sicilian. Those distinctions used to be important to some people, like those who wanted to know from what village in Sicily my maternal grandfather came (San Filipo). During my many years in graduate school, that same grandfather was highly skeptical. I must not be working like I should, to take so long, and then not even be a "real" doctor!

**Overview**: This book is an outgrowth of several years of filmmaking, plus a two-day conference, on Tribal Wisdom for Business Ethics. Beginning in 2010, I headed up a project which two years later produced a 28-minute educational film called *Tribal Wisdom for Business Ethics*. Released in 2012, the focus in the film was on the eight Aspects:

### **Eight Aspects of Tribal Wisdom**

- 1. Relationships are an end in themselves
- 2. Gifting is valued more highly
- 3. Egalitarianism is preferred

- 4. Non-acquisitiveness is valued not greed
- 5. Usefulness or access to use is valued
- 6. Barter for what is needed
- 7. Trust and Buyer Trust are valued
- 8. Disclosure is full and voluntary

**Films**: Then in 2013, I and my group of collaborators produced six shorter films:

- 1. Tribal Wisdom and Marketing Strategy;
- 2. Tribal Wisdom and Indigenous Ways of Knowing;
- 3. Indigenous Trading, Disclosure, and Barter;
- 4. Tribal Wisdom and Storytelling;
- 5. Tribal Wisdom and Entrepreneurship; and
- 6. Tribal Wisdom for Life-Enhancing Relationships.

In the process of interviewing the experts featured in the film, all expressed an interest in participating in a future conference on Tribal Wisdom.

Conference: Everyone was invited to New Mexico State University (NMSU) in Las Cruces, NM to share ideas. From those beginnings, we have this collaborative written work. This book allows us to go into more depth on particular topics. Also, we offer some frameworks to put these ideas into a coherent integrated approach for framing a mutually beneficial conversation between "Tribal Wisdom" and business ethics.

**Tribal Relevance**: Why should tribal people be interested in this book? First, we expect it will be reassuring for tribal people to see that the Euro-western business world shows indications of moving in directions more compatible with their traditional values and beliefs. This book might offer hope to some who think they will

have to give up traditional values, perhaps their very identity, to succeed in the non-tribal business world. We see the initial stages of development of a business community where tribal people would feel at home.

Second, as these values and practices are gathered from a variety of sources, this book offers a rare collection of traditional tribal wisdoms that have huge potential relevance for a business context. Finally, both tribal and non-tribal peoples will gain a greater understanding and appreciation of how business has been able to contribute to stronger communities with stronger relationships.

Co-Created Benefits: Each chapter in this book contributes to co-creating our collective vision. In this vision, businesses gain a better understanding of how tribal values and practices already have been introduced into the Euro-western business world. These values and practices can be developed further and used more widely for an increasingly ethical kind of success. At the same time, tribal peoples can be encouraged by the heightened awareness of how doing business "their way" may be compatible with, and may even be a key to their own success in the non-indigenous world.

It is my hope that we come to see ourselves not as "sides," as indigenous or non-indigenous. Rather, we are travelers on the same road, each seeking socially, spiritually, and economically sustainable paths through the world, paths which will nourish our unique cultures while fostering mutual benefit for all.

Map to the Territory: This book contains 19 chapters, many of which have embedded case examples and activities. There are also stand-alone case examples, questions, and activities. At the end of each chapter, you will see some "Search for Wisdom" questions, accompanied by a feather icon:

### **Search for Wisdom**



You will see "Grace Ann's Note" in a shadowed box to indicate that I am speaking, as follows:

### **Grace Ann's Note**

The chapters are divided into four parts. Part I is "Wisdom of the Elders." This section provides an orientation to Tribal Wisdom, indigenous ways-of-knowing, indigenous perspectives on the natural environment in relationship to humans and the business world, and a general orientation to business ethics.

In Chapter 1, I begin our journey by introducing the "eight aspects" of Tribal Wisdom. These concepts were identified in the previous work on Tribal Wisdom (described above) which was the impetus for the present volume. In addition to these eight core concepts, this chapter offers three reasons why Tribal Wisdom concepts might be insightfully applied to contemporary businesses.

In Chapter 2, Dr. Donald Pepion lets us inside some of his own personal journey to his position as a respected elder in his tribe. He describes how he sought wisdom from his elders. Currently, he passes on that wisdom both in the tribal community and through his extensive history of many important roles in university settings. In Chapter 3, Dr. Lisa Grayshield provides us with some enlightening quotes about indigenous ways-of-knowing and Euro-Western science. She discusses the sustainability implications for businesses.

In Chapter 4, Dr. Gregory Cajete contributes aspects of his long stream of environmentally oriented research. He discusses why ethics in business must address environmental issues. He explains how nature, in the principle of mutual reciprocal behavior, can guide us in understanding how we can live lives that are more ethical and sustainable. The Acoma Case concludes this chapter.

I end this first part of the book by placing Tribal Wisdom within a context of the recent trends in business ethics literature in Chapter 5. It is apparent that this literature is moving towards more relational and group-oriented concepts of ethics. Thus, the field is heading in the direction already visible in tribal values. Part I concludes with the case of the NOVA Corporation written by Mabel Sanchez. You are invited to "Search for Wisdom" by considering the questions at the end of the case.

Part II is entitled "Storytelling and Indigenous Pedagogies for Business Ethics." Here, we explore storytelling as a preferred indigenous way of conveying cultural information. Chapter 6 begins the section with a transcription of "A Coyote Story" as told by Dr. Gregory Cajete to Tribal Wisdom filmmakers in 2011.

In Chapter 7, Dr. David M. Boje explains the important differences between indigenous storytelling, traditional Euro-western storytelling, and what his theory calls "Living Story." He uses the concept of "antenarrative" to demonstrate the differences in these storytelling methodologies. In Chapter 8, I reappear to explain some of the particular ways tribes use storytelling to convey ethical principles. We conclude this section with a "Search for Wisdom" with several short example questions.

Now that we have set the stage with indigenous ways-of-knowing, eight Aspects of Tribal Wisdom, business ethics in general, and how these concepts are conveyed through story, Part III digs into more specific business practices, case examples, and ethical teachings. Part III begins with the case example of Dardan Enterprises, written by one of the co-founders of the company, Dr. Daniel Stewart. Next, Chapter 10 discusses "Native American Values Applied to Leadership and Business Ethics Education." Here, Amy Klemm Verbos, Deanna M. Kennedy, and Carma M. Claw, three American Indian professors teaching

in colleges of business, offer their views on how ethical values and principles were taught to them, from their various tribal traditions.

In Chapter 11, Dr. Calvin M. Boardman explains the different cultural roots and assumptions that led to different styles of trade among early tribes, even before contact with Euro-Westerners during colonization. He finds reasons for misunderstandings and conflicts in these different trading practices. He also sees hope for greater understanding as we move forward in finding more mutually beneficial ways of conducting business between the indigenous world and the Euro-Western one.

In Chapter 12, I return to discuss the need for equal power relationships, viewed from a storytelling perspective. "Power Stories and Mutually Beneficial Negotiations: Fostering Ensemble Leadership" demonstrates the disempowering potential of even desires to be helpful, when the situation is perceived as one of unequal power. The chapter concludes with a new theory of "Ensemble Leadership" whose roots go back to ancient Mesoamerican cultures.

We conclude Part III with another case from Drs. Daniel Stewart and Vincent J. Pascal. This concluding case is a hypothetical example based on some real-life dynamics of doing business to benefit a company's home community. The case, "Native American Entrepreneurship: Locating Your Business," asks you where you would locate a business: closer to its potential market, or closer to its potential employees, when those two groups are considerable distances apart.

Part IV focuses on Tribal Wisdom insights into businesses in partnership with the natural environment. I introduce this section with a short case example of the experience of our cover artist Virginia Maria Romero. In "Remember to Remember: The Alameda Transit Station," I recall the words of Dr. Gregory Cajete about the importance of remembering our connection to the natural world, as we are nature ourselves.

Dr. David M. Boje provides a penetrating critique of how the "Triple Bottom Line" of people, profit, and planet may not live up to its promise, in Chapter 15. In Chapter 16, Dr. Gerri Elise

McCulloh gives a personal account of growing up on the fringes of Bighorn Medicine Wheel, and experiencing firsthand the dilemma of protecting a natural environmental treasure and sacred site, while allowing appropriate access and appreciation of it.

Bringing these lessons home to our own relationships, Kaylynn Sullivan TwoTrees and Matthew Kolan offer the insightful Chapter 17, "The Trees Are Breathing Us: An Indigenous View of Relationship in Nature and Business." After reading this chapter, you will understand relationships in a whole new way.

Concluding the volume, Dr. Maria Humphries draws parallels between this book and her extensive experience with the Maori indigenous peoples of New Zealand. She fearlessly addresses the topic of what a non-indigenous female can contribute to this discussion. As an outsider living and studying indigenous cultures from both a critical theory perspective and an environmental perspective, she offers her personal views on bridging the indigenous/non-indigenous divide, in mutually beneficial ways.

Finally, we follow Dr. Gregory Cajete's advice in earlier chapters, about giving more "hints" as to the meaning of our morality tales than was traditionally done in tribes. So if you read this whole book, I promise not to leave you wondering. I offer suggested answers to some puzzling questions raised (mostly in Chapter 8), in the "Epilogue".

Free Materials: The Tribal Wisdom films that are part of the genesis of this book are complementary to, but not a replacement for, this volume. There are many points of connection between this book and the films, but very little repetition. All films, plus supporting teaching materials, were created through a grant from the NMSU Daniels Fund Ethics Initiative, and are available for free on the internet at:

http://business.nmsu.edu/research/programs/daniels-ethics/tribal-ethics/.

**Thanks**: We offer heartfelt thanks to the New Mexico State University Daniels Fund Ethics Initiative, which funded the early work on developing Tribal Wisdom ethics education materials beginning in 2010. They funded the educational filmmaking through 2013, and then in September of 2013 funded the Tribal Wisdom Conference. We are grateful for the many talented and articulate people who participated in the Tribal Wisdom project over the years.

Scholarships: To show appreciation for the all the indigenous scholars and business persons who participated, and to the Daniels Fund Ethics Initiative at NMSU, proceeds from this book will go to a fund for scholarships for American Indian students at NMSU. To contribute, contact the NMSU Foundation office by calling (800) 342-6678 or (575) 646-6126 during business hours. You can also search the web page at https://advancing.nmsu.edu/givenow or e-mail the office at giftacct@nmsu.edu.

**Intention**: My intention with this work is to encourage mutually respectful relationships. This intention finds expression in the words attributed to Lilla Watson, Gangulu woman, and Murri visual artist:

"If you have come here to help me, you are wasting our time. But if you have come because your liberation is tied up with mine, then let us work together".

Watson herself prefers that the quote be attributed to "Aboriginal activists group, Queensland, 1970s." It is my hope that this book helps readers to understand and appreciate themselves as well as others more fully so that we may all enjoy more harmonious relationships.

Grace Ann Rosile *Editor* 

## Part I Wisdom of the Elders

# Eight Aspects of Tribal Wisdom for Business Ethics, and Why They Matter

Grace Ann Rosile with cases by Carma M. Claw

Contexts — Traditional Native American Indian tribal cultures reflect a variety of differences from the Euro-Western American cultures. While both cultures engage in "business" as economic trade and negotiations, each comes from different social contexts. It is valuable for each tradition to learn about the nature of the other, as such cross-cultural explorations lead to a better understanding of one's own culture in comparison to an "other." These comparisons are most helpful when each side can discover, adapt, and adopt new ways of dealing with common challenges. Also, each culture offers a different story about how certain values and practices can play out over time.

Cross-Cultural — In this book, we offer a cross-cultural view, and a story of how some Native American Indian tribal traditions and practices can lead to a different way of doing business, both within and across cultural boundaries. These differences are often more a matter of emphasis rather than harsh divergences. Most differences we address are cases of more/less emphasis, not a sharp absence/presence distinction.

Resonances — If we work to find the resonances between tribal wisdoms and Euro-Western business practices, we contribute to the bridge between these different cultures. One important caution to the reader: We can never understand another's culture the way the other does, just as we can never truly understand another's experience except in a mediated, approximate way. Knowing this, we may yet benefit from this admittedly limited ability to experience and understand the "other," those who are unlike the self in some way.

Alligators — There is a humorous story about a tourist in Florida. She admired the necklace worn by a local Indian, and asked what it was made of. The Indian said: "Alligator's teeth." Fingering her own necklace of costly real pearls, she said somewhat patronizingly "I suppose that they mean as much to you as pearls do to us." "Oh no," the Indian objected. "Anyone can open an oyster."

We want to keep in mind that this cross-cultural venture is, as Dr. Don Pepion notes elsewhere in this volume, "a precarious journey." We want to remain humble, recognizing the inherent limitations in this cross-cultural effort. As Pepion reminded us, "Native and academic scholars must be attuned to ethical boundaries and trust in the process of how cultures create truth."

Guideposts — In this book, we cite similar trends and resonances in ethics, leadership, and organization, to help us anchor our understandings of each other's cultures in some perceived similarities. This does not mean that these similar features are "just like" something we know, and now we have our finger on "the" meanings we seek. Rather, these are a starting point, guideposts along the way, to give us glimmers of our goal of better understanding, each of the other.

**Self-Awareness** — As we are able to experience the other, in admittedly limited ways, we may see and understand ourselves better. This better understanding of self also allows for greater possibilities for change, and more informed choices about the nature and direction of change. From such a position, we will have greater potential for more ethical inclusiveness, for more mutual influence, for more of Boje's cocreated storying, for the mutual advantage of all.

# **Eight Aspects of Tribal Wisdom and Relevance for Business Ethics**

We have chosen eight values and practices commonly found in tribal indigenous cultures which are most relevant to the conduct of business. While there are by some estimates over 500 such tribal cultures among Native American Indians alone, and there may be more differences than similarities among these various tribes, yet there are some common elements. These common themes are drawn from a variety of tribal cultures, and are common to most American Indian tribes. We focus on the similarities which we perceive from studying indigenous and non-indigenous scholars,

Table 1.1: Eight Aspects of Tribal Wisdom versus Euro-Western Business Values and Practices.

Eight Aspects of Tribal Wisdom	Euro-Western Values/Practices	
1. <i>Relationships</i> are an end in themselves	Relationships are a means to an end	
2. <i>Gifting</i> is valued more highly	Getting/acquiring is valued	
3. <i>Egalitarianism</i> is preferred	Hierarchy is preferred	
4. <i>Non-acquisitiveness</i> is valued not greed	Accumulation of wealth	
5. <i>Usefulness</i> or access to use is valued	Ownership is most valued	
6. <i>Barter</i> for what is needed	Acquire according to supply/demand	
7. <i>Trust</i> and Buyer Trust are valued	Buyer Beware still exists	
8. <i>Disclosure</i> is full and voluntary	Truth to the extent required by law	

*Note:* The Eight Aspects discussed in the above table are excerpted and modified slightly from Rosile (2014), IACCM Conference Proceedings.